

Appendix H – Supplementary Data

Theme	Subtheme	Interview Data	Ethnographic Data
<p>The Proposed Changes to the Gender Recognition Act 2004</p>	<p>Government and politicians</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <i>I think it seems to me that political parties have been frightened of having that debate themselves (P13A)</i> ● <i>I haven't seen anything useful from them. (P10B)</i> ● <i>Absolutely not! No. quite the opposite. (P5B)</i> ● <i>I think they tiptoed into it without any clue what they were fucking doing. They have been woken up by women. (P16A)</i> ● <i>They didn't prepare us for the debate, they just launched the consultation and many of us didn't know it was coming...along with it... a lot of trans propaganda appeared. (P14B)</i> 	

	The Left	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Unfortunately, labour got hold of it and showed themselves up...the left-wing parties let women down that much... (P4A) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • I was a member of the Labour Party but I believe that humans can't change sex, women are discriminated against based on their sex, no child is born wrong and same-sex attraction is real and great. I left so you can't #ExpelMe #LabourLosingWomen #TwoPlusTwoEqualsFour
	Self-ID	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In law I think self ID is hugely problematic to existing sex-based exemptions (P3A) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Just caught the very last bit of #SkyPapers & @ZubyMusic is such a sensible lad, isn't he? Calmly explains that someone who does not believe in self-ID is not a bigot, almost every single person in the world had this view just 10 years ago.
Why Campaign	Feminism, Women's Rights, and activism	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Some women in the Union came to me and said had I seen the plans to move to self ID and did I not think that is going to impact on women's rights and I said "oh yea, I think that might actually." (P7A) • People are just not educated. (P2B) • I think there is a huge issue of misogyny. I am not saying that everyone that believes that 	

		<p><i>transwomen should be allowed in are misogynists, but I think the core of the trans rights activists are, and that is their motivation. (P5A)</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <i>I don't actually think society has understood the issues of patriarchy, so you kind of get stuck in an argument that dismisses people for being different. (P11B)</i> ● <i>It is actually a bigger issue on what are women's boundaries and who has the right to determine what they are. (P8A)</i> ● <i>If we want to make changes here, what does it mean over there? (P13B)</i> 	
	<p>Transgender Rights Movement</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <i>So, there is a lot of pressure from the trans lobby and it has been very quick and very forceful, with a lot of very vocal people who seem to have rushed this through. (P10A)</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <i>Non-sarcastic conclusion: queer theory and gender studies cliques are not a safe space for female homosexuals, either as theoreticians or as subject matter. And since academics often set terms for policy, this has serious consequences for lesbians in non-academic communities.</i>

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>That is the concern and obviously that relates to the way in which the trans umbrella has got ever more powerful encouraged by Stonewall and other LGBT organisations. It includes so many people, those with gender dysphoria, part time cross dressers, fetishists. (P13A)</i> • <i>Quite a lot of people find transwomen viscerally disgusting and I have had people say to me, they can't look at a trans woman without laughing and they are so tall and look at their hands you can always tell and to me that sort of language is hateful, that is pure discrimination, that has got nothing to do with whether you are a feminist or not. (P4B)</i> • <i>I suppose the most important thing to say is that none of this has anything to do with transwomen themselves. (P14A)</i> 	
What is a Woman?	Adult Human Female	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>A woman is an Adult human female. (P6A)</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>In conclusion: yes, women have the right to exclude all male people from women-only</i>

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>A woman is a biological description. (P12A)</i> 	<p><i>spaces #whatisawomanRdg #feministsarenotnazis</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>There has been a recent shift in language over from transwomen to trans female. It's very clear what's going on.</i> • <i>Do you know, for a long time in this debate I was reasonably happy with giving you 'woman' so long as we could keep 'female'. But you really want all the words, don't you?</i>
	<p><i>Transwomen are women</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Virtually the first thing that Penny Mordaunt said when she was appointed women and equalities minister was "transwomen are women", so if you take that as your starting point, you frame any kind of discussion and dialogue around this as "you debating my right to exist" which is sort of the second trans mantra, then that shuts down all discussion. (P13A)</i> • <i>If you are sticking by your argument that transwomen are women and sex is a social construct and all that nonsense, then there is nothing I can</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Transwomen are women. Trans men are men. Trans rights are human rights. This is not up for debate. #TransDayOfVisibility</i> • <i>The dictionary definition of woman is adult human female. As we're talking about trans and cis women's rights, it's useful to consider the legal definition of female. A trans-woman with a Gender Recognition Certificate can have their birth certificate changed to female.</i> • <i>A few folks are unhappy that I didn't use the word woman. #SorryNotSorry. There are people who have a uterus who aren't women. Namely: children, aka girls; and people who</i>

		<p><i>really do for you because you are stupid! (P4A)</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <i>To tell us what we have to accept and that 'transwomen are women' it is deeply fucking offensive. (P16A)</i> ● <i>Anyone who identifies as a woman, anyone who wants to be a woman. (P3B)</i> ● <i>What is a woman is when other people start seeing you as a woman and they start responding to you as a woman. (P9B)</i> 	<p><i>don't identify as a female or woman, aka trans men, or non-binary people.</i></p>
<p>Silencing</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <i>Prior to speaking out, yes, I knew it would be messy, because it is such a toxic discussion. Well, it is not really a discussion...there is this really loud vocal group of people who will call you a transphobe as soon as you try and discuss it. (P6A)</i> ● <i>I know for example that I am not getting invited to things which I would reasonably be expected to be invited to speak at. Something I am speaking at this week; the organisers have been approached</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <i>Let's be clear. This is blatant bullying of a professional woman to silence her and scare others from speaking up. Her crime was liking tweets from @Transgendertrd.</i> ● <i>Women are abused in the name of 'trans rights'. But do MPs care? Prof Rosa Freedman of @UniofReading is getting rape threats and urine sprayed on her door for asking questions about trans rights and the law. This cannot stand.</i>

		<p><i>and questioned about my suitability... (P7A)</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <i>I have felt heard...I tend to align myself with people who think like me so it is often a surprise when people to pop up on Facebook, or in my life who is counter to me and then you are reminded that not everybody is as broad as you are. (P2B)</i> ● <i>No, I haven't felt silenced, I have chosen to stop talking about it at one point because it felt too toxic and wasn't getting anywhere. (P13B)</i> ● <i>Loads of people tried to get me sacked. (P4A)</i> ● <i>There is my other problem with this movement, it is incredibly good at shutting things down, it is really hard to see what it is attempting to create. Incredibly good at telling people to stop talking but not so good at telling them what to be doing instead... validate me or stop talking. (P3A)</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <i>"Silencing women has always been the most effective way of controlling women." #WomensLiberation2020 #WPUK.</i> ● <i>We came into this space to ensure women's voices were heard in matters of material concern to us. Collectively, we have all made some progress but not enough. Women are still being silenced and attacked.</i> ● <i>Your whole attempt at silencing is predicated on the claim that our views make certain people 'unsafe.' (And, while we're here, you really do need to do some work on this leveraging of 'unsafety.')</i> ● <i>Sex is a protected characteristic under law. Why is it 'bigotry' to want to protect women and girls? Why are you and others so afraid of this conversation you demand the police join you in silencing others? Because you know you have got no argument?</i>
--	--	--	--

	<p>#TERF/Bigot/Transphobe – “We Found the Witch Burn her!”</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Yes, TERF, Bigot, shallow, fake...it's a lot. (P11A)</i> • <i>I was called a transphobic bitch on twitter...it is just a cover for abusing women indiscriminately. (P13A)</i> • <i>People use that acronym all the time as though it isn't offensive, and it really is offensive...and it just shows how successful the TRAs have been in framing themselves as victims and the rest of us are witches. (P5A)</i> • <i>I don't agree with the term it's a nonsense, it is thrown around by people without any real understanding...if you want to suggest that someone is transphobic just say that. (P4B)</i> • <i>I have also if I have heard staff using the word TERF in the office, I have said that is not acceptable. It is inflammatory language; it would not be acceptable to use language that is transphobic either. (P8B)</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>If you don't believe transwomen are women' for all purposes - oh dear. That's enough to get you branded a terf. Acceptance without exception is required.</i> • <i>I am not talking about identity. Identity is just beliefs. I am talking about people's realities. PS This is 2019 now. We don't use violence tagging words like TERF anymore.</i> • <i>James Dreyfus - claims not to be transphobic but won't accept that transwomen are women. And shares TERF propaganda at every opportunity. Here he is proudly wearing the t-shirt of transphobic hate group 'Human Females'.</i> • <i>TERFs are bigots. TERF is not a slur. TERFs are trash. Get into the garbage can where you belong.</i> • <i>A gentle reminder to all my trans & non-binary fam on TERFs: Why do you think TERFs have never had a TERF parade? 1) They'd have to go public and stop hiding behind anon accounts on twitter. 2) Their alt-right buddies might show up; help prove they're a bunch of Nazis'.</i>
--	--	---	---

			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <i>It took a while to report every terf in the replies, but I managed it.</i> ● <i>Wrong; You're a TERF. pure trash fire truscum. Never forget that.</i> ● <i>Let's show them what oxford REALLY looks like.</i> <p><i>#FuckTerfs</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <i>The idea that trans folks are "just mad because TERFs won't validate us, or have sex with us," is laughable and plays into TERF rhetoric. We fight TERFs because they seek to harm us, and to put us in constant danger. We fight TERFs because they want to see us dead.</i>
<p>Motivation for Access to Single Sex Spaces</p>	<p>Male Predators and Sex Offenders</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <i>The first thing to be really clear about is that the trans lobby group says, 'oh you are accusing all transwomen of being violent' and that isn't the point, the point is if you cannot exclude anyone who appears to be a man then you have no way of maintaining single sex spaces. (P14A)</i> ● <i>In this particular context, there is an obvious incentive for abusive people to misapply the law, either they will</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <i>We discussed gender self-identification last night #newsnight It's not "these people ". It's the fact a blanket law would allow any predatory man to self-identify as female to gain access to women. That's the danger.</i> ● <i>#Thread violent sexual predators & paedophiles, ID'd as trans giving them access to women &; children. Allowing them also, to be housed in women's prisons. Who'da thunk it eh? #SexNotGender They are MEN.</i>

		<p><i>do it cynically or accidentally but given that aforementioned history of violence against women and females if you give males the opportunity to self ID into female spaces and resources then some bad actors will take advantage of that opportunity. (P6A)</i></p>	
	Sexual Fetish and Validation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Only a small number of people who are doing the transsexuality...it is largely still older men who have gone through all the breast augmentation but have maintained their penises. It does feel very fetishistic. (P14A)</i> • <i>They want to be validated, because they don't care about women in refuges. (P11A)</i> 	
The Male Violence Against Women sector	Transgender Victims of Male Violence		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>There aren't studies on other violence rates to compare because the studies that exist are apples-and-oranges comparisons. The US Transgender Survey uses self-reporting of violence all the way down to "grabbing", compared to Bureau of Justice Statistics which begins at "assault".</i>

			<ul style="list-style-type: none">● <i>2016 rates, using HRC data, FBI data, etc., murder per 100K pop:</i> <i>0.8 - females who are trans-</i> <i>1.6 - all trans- people</i> <i>2.1 - males who are trans-</i> <i>2.1 - females</i> <i>5.0 - black females</i> <i>5.4 - all US population</i> <i>7.4 - males</i> <i>18.3 - black people</i> <i>32.7 - black males</i> <i>204.0 – prostitutes</i>● <i>I still see the "four times" number touted in the media. One egregious math mistake is ON the page where the claim is made. They conveniently don't count the female murder rate (though it is available). They selectively use the Williams Study data. You should look to yourself.</i>
--	--	--	---

	Importance of female only spaces	<ul style="list-style-type: none">● <i>Having a man in your space after suffering and surviving is just horrifying really. The fear would make you ill. (P11A)</i>● <i>They are critical to women's recovering and thriving. (P12A)</i>● <i>Yes, they are, and I am always trying to insert this part of the argument back into the debate about single sex spaces. (P4B)</i>● <i>That body is male, and that body cannot be in female space... it is in our fucking bones that we are frightened of men, and they are men... (P16A)</i>● <i>I don't know that we need trans only shelters, I think that that is a little othering. (P14B)</i>● <i>I think some individuals may want that for themselves, but I think it is women only... when you have a woman's groups and maybe there is a transwoman in that group...I actually think it is perfectly possible to do some really important work around that. (P13B)</i>	
--	----------------------------------	--	--

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>I would think that was a really asymmetrical response, because I would want to know why the males didn't need educating and why we weren't prepared to educate policy makers into funding those spaces... (P6A)</i> 	
	Stonewall Research	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>I think self-ID is ok. However, if that is necessary then there has to be some real thought to how services are delivered. (1)</i> 	
	Equality Act 2010 and Single Sex Exemptions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>What is actually needed and what the government should have done is to do a retranslation of the EA2010...It is confusing because you can't ask for a GRC or it could be discrimination to ask someone if they are trans. (P4B)</i> • <i>I think the SSE should be opt out not opt in! If a service wants to do something different then they have to do justify their opting out. (P15A)</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>In conclusion: yes, women have the right to exclude all male people from women-only spaces #whatisawomanRdg #feministsarenotnazis</i> • <i>It's telling that @stonewalluk actively went after female-only shelters to push for this abusive dangerous practice & lied to them about #EqualityAct as it DOES NOT allow for this or for self-ID. SEX is a protected category not gender. Read actual law not fake one peddled by them.</i>

	<p>Commissioning and Policy capture</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <i>I mean I sort of feel like we already effectively have it. (P12B)</i> ● <i>There is a great risk of being de-funded, some local authorities have taken a really hard line. (P15A)</i> ● <i>Those services that aren't trans inclusive will definitely have their funding cut. (P9A)</i> ● <i>We will be terribly vulnerable to all sorts of legal challenges (P2A)</i> ● <i>The impact on us is more likely to be for funders so our ability to maintain women only spaces is going to be threatened. (P1A)</i> ● <i>The law is set up so that people in the women's sector can't speak out, given the funding situation is so low and the various ways in which it is hard to criticise the government if they are receiving funding...that has hampered serious valuable debate. (P6A)</i> ● 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <i>@thesundaytimes @womensaid @womensaidorg and it's not just the women for crying out loud. Children come in unable to even bloody speak through fear and trauma. So, are you going to care for us or do we not even matter when at our lowest point?</i> ● <i>Really? @thesundaytimes @womensaid @womensaidorg why isn't it clear that it isn't only safety concerns that means abused women cannot cope with someone not female. You're traumatised, you can't deal with seeing/hearing anyone male. Why do we have to even say this?</i> ● <i>@rapecrisisscot @scotwomensaid what has changed in the last six years to make you forget who your core service users are and what their needs are?</i> ● <i>@rapecrisisscot I was out with a group of women, twenties thru to forties, all left leaning, and this came up. Every one of them said they would not use these services now. They have lost the trust of women. We know their funding depends on abandoning single sex provisions.</i> ● <i>@rapecrisisscot I personally know two women who self-excluded from your service in Glasgow</i>

			<p><i>five years ago. They sought counselling elsewhere and navigated high court rape trials without support. You can't say there are no issues as you can't monitor self-exclusion.</i></p>
<p>Middle Ground and Third Space option</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <i>I wouldn't be completely against third space. I don't think it would completely solve the issue though, because if a third space was provided you would quickly see a big drop in the number of trans people that would access them (P10A)</i> ● <i>I would support the development trans specific services (P1A)</i> ● <i>There should also be spaces for trans people and queer people, just like there should be spaces for women who are subjected to FGM or any other gender-based violence that need specialist support. (P12B)</i> ● <i>I think those discussions ought to be had and I have had similar discussions before and going back to a third option yes that is something to discuss. (P1B)</i> 	

		<ul style="list-style-type: none">• <i>With the trans community I am sure there are arguments that there is significant vulnerability and harm in that community, but it is also a minority issue and I think there is an argument for dedicated service offerings. (P6B)</i>	
--	--	---	--